THE BURNOUT CRISIS:

A Call to Invest in ECE and Child and Youth Workers

SEPTEMBER 2022









About Us

BGC Canada

For 120+ years, BGC Canada has been creating opportunities for millions of Canadian kids and teens. As Canada's largest child and youth serving charitable organization, our Clubs open their doors to young people and their families at 775 locations nationwide. During out-of-school hours in small and large cities, and rural and Indigenous communities, our trained staff and volunteers provide programs and services that help young people realize positive outcomes in self-expression, academics, healthy living, physical activity, job readiness, mental health, leadership, and more. Opportunity changes everything. For more information visit bgccan.com

Canadian Child Care Federation

The Canadian Child Care Federation (CCCF) is Canada's early learning and child care (ELCC) community—ECEs and providers from coast to coast to coast. We give voice to the deep passion, experience and practice of ELCC in Canada. The CCCF is a large, vibrant organization representing and uniting its affiliates and members from across Canada—coast to coast to coast since 1983. It is Canada's largest national, non-profit, charitable ELCC organization. We're proud to be a member and service-based organization, focused on early learning and child care. There is simply no CCCF without this nation's talented and hard working ECEs. For more information visit cccf-fcsge.ca

Canadian Mental Health Association

Founded in 1918, the Canadian Mental Health Association (CMHA) is the most established, most extensive community mental health organization in Canada. Through a presence in more than 330 communities across every province and one territory, CMHA provides advocacy, programs and resources that help to prevent mental health problems and illnesses, support recovery and resilience, and enable all Canadians to flourish and thrive. For more information, please visit cmha.ca.

YWCA Canada

YWCA Canada is a leading voice for women, girls, Two-Spirit and gender diverse people. For 150 years, we've been at the forefront of a movement: to fight gender-based violence, build affordable housing and advocate for workplace equity. We work to advance gender equity by responding to urgent needs in communities, through national advocacy and grassroots initiatives. Local YWCAs invest over \$258 million annually to support over 330,000 individuals across the nation. Today, we engage young leaders, diverse communities, and corporate partners to achieve our vision of a safe and equitable Canada for all. For more information visit www.wcacanada.ca

Authors

- Aniska Ali, Director of Philanthropy, YWCA Canada
- Don Giesbrecht, CEO, Canadian Child Care Federation
- Jen Turner, Manager, Public Policy and Engagement, BGC Canada
- Robin McMillan, Innovator Projects, Programs and Partnerships, Canadian Child Care Federation
- Sarah Kennell, National Director Public Policy, Canadian Mental Health Association

With additional support from:

- Anjum Sultana, Director of Youth Leadership & Policy Advocacy, Plan International Canada
- Amanda Arella, Director, Public Policy, Advocacy, and Strategic Communications, YWCA Canada
- Deb Wise Harris, National Manager, Communications, Canadian Mental Health Association
- Gwendolyn Moncrieff-Gould, Director, Public Policy and Engagement, BGC Canada
- Stevie Shipman, Senior Designer and Production Manager, BGC Canada

Introduction

Burnout among frontline staff working with children and youth has increased during COVID-19. This policy brief surfaces emerging areas of concern for Early Childhood Educators (ECEs) and Child and Youth Workers during the pandemic. We explore these challenges through an intersectional approach, including gender, race, and socioeconomic considerations. The brief puts forward areas requiring further research and exploration on how to better support the mental health of front line workers – particularly those experiencing marginalization. In addition, it includes recommendations for how each level of government can best support the mental health of these populations to reduce burnout, foster good mental health, and avoid further mental health issues. This is particularly relevant now as the federal, provincial, and territorial governments look to implement the national child care program.

Methodology

ECEs and Child and Youth Workers (n=6) were interviewed about their experience working during the pandemic. These interviews informed the development of the brief and our recommendations. BGC, CCCF, CMHA and YWCA used expertise from our work to develop the recommendations and confirm their accuracy in understanding the broader landscape of the care sector.

Of the six child care workers interviewed, four were Early Childhood Educators and two were Child and Youth Workers. The workers were located in British Columbia, Alberta, Ontario, and Newfoundland. Five participants work in the non-profit sector and one runs a home-based child care program. Limitations to the methodology include the small number of participants and the absence of participants from the North. We hope this brief will begin a conversation about the challenges facing the child and youth workforce across the country and spark further research to test our findings.

Background

It goes without saying that the pandemic has left, and will continue to leave, a lasting mark on our lives. Extensive research makes clear the significant impact the pandemic has had on the global economy, our mental health, our healthcare system, and countless other facets of society. COVID-19 has transformed the way workplaces are structured, how we care for one another, and our outlook for the future.

Thirty-seven percent (37%) of Canadians report a deterioration in their mental health since the onset of the pandemic. As this brief will explore, the impact on frontline staff working with children and youth is disproportionately high and yet only one third of employees have access to programs to prevent burnout. Additionally, only one third of employees say they would feel comfortable talking to their supervisor about mental health issues and believe this would not impact their career.

One in three Canadians are worried about their finances and 16% worry about having enough food⁴. The social determinants of health like employment, food security, adequate housing, and income supports all contribute to our mental health and well-being⁵. The pandemic has put pressure on these supports, causing an increase in mental health challenges. This is particularly felt by those working with children and youth who often earn low wages and are in precarious work.

We are in relatively uncharted waters as we navigate more than two years of the pandemic. The pandemic has taken a serious toll on our mental and physical health, which were not built to withstand this degree of stress over such a prolonged period. Our ability to be 'resilient' in the face of such prolonged stress is waning. But the resiliency 'muscle' that we rely on to overcome difficult moments or

- 1 https://cmha.ca/brochure/summary-of-key-findings-ubc-4
- 2 https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5f31a311d93d0f2e28aaf04a/t/61e59ce735bb7b24705729 9d/1642437865230/Long+Form+EN+Final+-+MHRC+PHS+Report.pdf
- 3 https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5f31a311d93d0f2e28aaf04a/t/61e59ce735bb7b24705729 9d/1642437865230/Long+Form+EN+Final+-+MHRC+PHS+Report.pdf
- 4 https://cmha.ca/brochure/summary-of-key-findings-ubc-4
- 5 https://ontario.cmha.ca/provincial-policy/social-determinants

stresses in life needs to be strengthened over time. It requires attention and rest. The duration and stress associated with the pandemic are having a significant impact on our ability to be resilient.

We do not yet know the long-term impacts of the pandemic on our mental health, but we do know that frontline workers have experienced higher levels of stress, anxiety and depression. Women, 2SLGBTQ+ individuals, racialized individuals, (im)migrants and parents have experienced compounding impacts on their mental health, with reported higher levels of stress, anxiety and depression than the general population. This includes those working with children and youth, from teachers to youth workers, and Early Childhood Educators to parents. Extended periods of isolation, social disconnection, school and childcare closures, limited contact with family, friends and community, together have shone a light on caregiver labour in our society.

During the pandemic, women have taken on the majority of responsibilities when it comes to care work and domestic labour. A recent study found that although four in ten Canadians reported an increase in hours spent on domestic work during the pandemic, women are more likely than men to report spending their largest share of time preparing meals and cleaning? Seventy-one percent (71%) of women reported challenges such as anxiety, stress, or depression due to an increase in housework and care work, compared to 65% of men⁸. These challenges are not felt equally by all populations, as Black and Indigenous respondents were more likely to report challenges due to these increased care burdens, including the need to give up looking for paid work.⁹ Racialized women were also twice as likely as white women to stop working because of care responsibilities.¹⁰

"I have too much to do – it's constantly go, go go – no enjoyment or settlement. You have to help kids with their homework, plus do your own work, and housework. It never ends." - Participant, Front line worker

Ninety-six percent (96%) of ECEs in Canada are women¹¹ and Child and Youth Workers are also disproportionately women. They have faced additional burdens during the pandemic, including providing essential services, home schooling or child care, as well as the extra burden of unpaid caregiving.¹² Many women have left their jobs in order to meet these domestic demands. "Unless the care economy is better supported, a generation of women may exit the labour force entirely, reducing household spending and deepening the recession." In addition, one third of ECEs are immigrants or non-permanent residents in comparison to one quarter of workers in other occupations¹⁴ which further compounds these challenges.

- 6 https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5f31a311d93d0f2e28aaf04a/t/60eca927e771871 7d7659361/1626122538301/FINAL+-+MHRC+Mental+Health+During+COVID+Poll+7+Report.pdf
- 7 www.oxfam.ca/news/71-per-cent-of-canadian-women-feeling-more-anxious-depressed-isolatedoverworked-or-ill-because-of-increased-unpaid-care-work-caused-by-covid-19-oxfam-survey
- 8 Ibid
- A Feminist Economic Recovery Plan for Canada, YWCA Canada and Institute for Gender and the Economy, 2020 www.feministrecovery.ca/the-plan and Oxfam (2020). 71 per cent of Canadian women feel more anxious, depressed, isolated, overworked or ill because of increased unpaid care work caused by COVID-19: Oxfam survey. Retrieved from: www.oxfam.ca/news/71-per-cent-of-canadian-women-feeling-moreanxious-depressed-isolated-overworked-or-ill-because-of-increasedunpaid-care-work-caused-by-covid-19-oxfam-survey
- A Feminist Economic Recovery Plan for Canada, YWCA Canada and Institute for Gender and the Economy, 2020 www.feministrecovery.ca/the-plan and Bezanson, K., Bevan, A., and Lysack, M. (2020). Future Proofing: Federal Leadership for Childcare System Building. Retrieved from: www.childcarecanada.org/sites/default/files/Bezanson-Bevan-Lysack-Canada-childcare-system.pdf
- 11 ECE Report, Workforce Report 2022: https://ecereport.ca/en/workforce-report
- A Feminist Economic Recovery Plan for Canada, YWCA Canada and Institute for Gender and the Economy, 2020 www.feministrecovery.ca/the-plan and Alon, T. et al. (2020). The Impact of COVID-19 on Gender Equality. Northwestern University. Retrieved from: http://faculty.wcas. northwestern.edu/~mdo738/research/COVID19_Gender_Ma
- 13 A Feminist Economic Recovery Plan for Canada, YWCA Canada and Institute for Gender and the Economy, 2020 www.feministrecovery.ca/the-plan
- 14 ECE Report, Workforce Report 2022: https://ecereport.ca/en/workforce-report

Strengthening public investments in care will facilitate women's return to the paid work they left during the pandemic due to heavy caregiving burdens that men have been less likely to take on. This will add millions of jobs, particularly for women and provide significant returns to the economy, while also supporting children's development. Without support for care services, the economic recovery will be delayed¹⁵.

(Under)value of Early Childhood Education and Child and Youth Work

Despite advances in intersectional gender equality,¹⁶ the work associated with caring for children and youth has been viewed as a domestic issue, primarily the responsibility of women. Early Childhood Educators (ECEs) and Child and Youth Workers are vital to the success of the economy. However, their work is grossly undervalued and overlooked, as evidenced by stagnant wages and chronic underinvestment in what is an essential part of our social safety net. Due to historic underinvestment at all levels of government, these roles have become increasingly precarious, offering workers little security, even while the need for their services has grown radically.¹⁷

"We've been left out when people talk about essential workers

– but they have kids and they need us in order to go to work."

- Participant, Frontline worker

The undervaluing of child care work has meant a steady decrease in the number of people entering the child care sector. In addition, approximately 50% of ECEs leave the field within the first 5 years¹⁸. According to participants, many want to come into the field but a lack of funding means employers pay low hourly wages and are unable to offer sufficient hours. This leads to high turnover with many leaving the sector completely.

"A lot of people want to come into the field but there's not enough hours for less money and we can't afford to give them what they need. More funds for wages and time off would be appreciated." - Participant, Frontline worker

Beyond these challenges, discussions about Early Childhood Education and Child and Youth Work often omit considerations about access to and the delivery of care in rural and remote communities and about the experiences of (im)migrant, racialized, and Indigenous people. There is a need for further research into access to child and youth care in rural and remote settings and the particular experiences of diverse communities in both delivering and accessing such care.

Despite this omission, the pandemic has led to a moment of social awakening to the critical need for access to reliable and quality care for children and youth. The federal government's commitment to establishing a national child care program is a positive step towards recognizing the value of Early Childhood Education, and promoting job growth and retention. Scaling up child care services as part of a national child care program will require additional supports for the workforce in this sector.

- A Feminist Economic Recovery Plan for Canada, YWCA Canada and Institute for Gender and the Economy, 2020 <u>www.feministrecovery.ca/the-plan</u>
- Definition from Canadian Women.org: "Advancing gender equality in Canada isn't just about closing gaps between men and women. People experience different barriers depending on many elements of their identities—things like their sexuality, race, gender identity, ability, and age. Pursuing true equality means recognizing and meeting all peoples' diverse needs.

 Therefore by using an intersectional approach to gender equality that means we try to understand the many ways different women are affected by barriers and discrimination that go beyond their gender."
- 17 A Feminist Economic Recovery Plan for Canada, YWCA Canada and Institute for Gender and the Economy, 2020 www.feministrecovery.ca/the-plan
- 18 https://childcarecanada.org/documents/child-care-news/16/06/one-five-early-childhood-educators-plan-leave-profession

Key findings

In addition to the overarching challenges within the sector, the COVID-19 pandemic has introduced some new and emerging challenges for Early Childhood Educators and Child and Youth Workers. A theme that emerged in the interviews was the hard work of maintaining a sense of normalcy and consistency for the children and youth in their care, despite the challenges associated with delivering essential services during a pandemic.

Staffing Shortages

Child care programs across the country are facing staffing shortages. For example, an organization in BC received 2 resumes for open ECE positions from September to December, 2021, and both individuals canceled their interviews. That organization has 50 toddlers on a waitlist but they don't have the staff to support these families. Another organization indicated that they sometimes need parents to pick up their children early because they don't have the staff to remain open. This causes a ripple effect in the economy as workers with children may need to leave their jobs or reduce their hours if they do not have access to care.

This staffing shortage adds additional stress for existing staff who have to manage a higher workload. Participants spoke about feeling guilty for taking days off because of the impact it would have on their coworkers, who are already overworked and stretched, and risking burnout.

"You only take days off when you need it like for a doctor's appointment.

You're not taking vacation days or 'me days' because it's going to negatively impact
your coworkers." - Participant, Frontline worker

High Turnover

19

As previously stated, approximately 50% of ECEs leave the field within the first 5 years.¹⁹ Participant ECEs and Child and Youth Workers confirmed this as they spoke about the high turnover rate within the sector. This high turnover rate further contributes to staffing shortages as well as to a lack of consistency for children and their families.

The largest issue in the ECE and Child and Youth sector is low wages. ECEs require a post-secondary education and specialized skills, but the salary does not reflect that. Many people in the field have trouble supporting themselves, or their families, on their salary and therefore look for other opportunities even if their passion is early childhood education or child and youth work.

Turnover has also increased during the pandemic. Individuals may fear contracting COVID-19 in a high risk environment, or are seeking jobs where they can work from home in the event of another lockdown. In addition, many Early Childhood Educators and Child and Youth Workers cobbled together part-time work at multiple locations in order to reach full time hours. Workers were no longer able to work in multiple locations during the pandemic. These new limits to their hours and incomes caused them to look for employment elsewhere.

"We can't keep staff because of low wages because they can't live on it.

Kids get used to people coming and going which breaks my heart."

- Participant, Frontline worker

https://childcarecanada.org/documents/child-care-news/16/06/one-five-early-childhood-educators-plan-leave-profession

Stress of Delivering Quality Programs and Keeping Kids Safe

Another pandemic-related stress is the need to deliver quality programs while following COVID-19 safety protocols to keep children safe. While working in a care setting for children, staff need to keep an eye on them at all times to ensure they aren't touching things or breaking social distancing recommendations. It is also difficult to provide high-quality, engaging programs when ECEs and Child and Youth Workers are very limited in the activities and programming they can offer to children. Throughout the pandemic, ECEs and Child and Youth Workers had limited supplies – as they were only able to use toys or art supplies that weren't shared. This required staff to come up with new programming ideas on top of doing additional cleaning, additional supervision, and with less staff.

In addition, emotional regulation challenges of the children and youth increased as many are struggling with the stress and uncertainty of the pandemic. ECEs and Child and Youth Workers want to ensure they are supporting children and youth through a very challenging time and support them in building resiliency; while also ensuring other children in attendance maintain their quality programming.

"All of our kids pick up on our anxiety about COVID-19. If they get a stuffy nose they panic –they can tell we get stressed about it and they pick up on that."

- Participant, Frontline worker interviewed

Lack of Clarity Around Government COVID-19 Regulations

ECEs and Child and Youth Workers also faced a lack of clarity around the COVID-19 regulations for their sector. Often they would receive the safety regulations related to child care centres with very little notice, or were not provided with adequate PPE to implement them effectively. Many ECEs spoke about feeling that child care was an afterthought in the COVID-19 response, and was not supported as an essential service.

Along with needing to understand and implement the safety regulations, workers also needed to communicate the new regulations to parents and children. Parents had understandable anxiety about bringing children into a congregate setting during the pandemic, and ECEs needed to reassure parents that the centre was safe, while also communicating the most recent regulations. In addition, workers needed to explain rules to children who often didn't understand why they weren't allowed to play normally. ECEs would often need to find a balance between being honest with children about the risks, and not scaring them further.

"Coming out of COVID – there was a lot of managing parents we had to do.

They had a lot of questions about how we were keeping kids safe and we had to reassure them and make them comfortable on top of doing our job."

- Participants, Frontline worker

Mental Health

Given staffing shortages, high turn-over, lack of clarity around COVID-19 regulations, and the stress of delivering quality programs while keeping kids safe, it is no wonder that ECEs and Child and Youth Workers were struggling with their mental health. Participants stressed the need for additional mental health supports. They cited concerns about growing waitlists, and trouble finding the time for their own therapy with so many other responsibilities.

Another theme that emerged from the interviews was the emotional exhaustion experienced by essential workers with their own childcare responsibilities, which caused short tempers with coworkers and others in their life.

The mental health of care workers has an impact on the quality care children and youth receive. With such an emotionally demanding job, workers who are struggling will not be able to fully engage with and show up for children in the program.

"Can be difficult to manage everything – the kids can tell something is off. I'm trying to keep the kids from telling there is something off by putting a smile on but they know."

- Participant, Frontline worker

Recommendations

We need to see systemic-level change across all levels of government to address the immediate and pressing workforce issues that are experienced by Early Childhood Educators and Child and Youth Workers.

A strong, healthy, and supported early childhood and child and youth workforce is integral to the success of child care programs. This includes purposeful planning and support for mental health supports, increased wages, recognition, recruitment, retention and professional development. In order to address these challenges holistically, we also need to see increased investment in community-based mental health supports and affordable child care for all people in Canada.

We call on the levels of government to take specific action across the following priority areas:

Priority areas for policy change and investment	FEDERAL Government	PROVINCIAL AND Territorial Governments	MUNICIPAL Governments
System Building			
Integrate child care as a key element of all economic recovery plans, across government ministries	X	x	x
Use federal funds within existing child care agreements to develop comprehensive workforce strategies as an essential element of quality and comprehensive Early Learning and Child Care (ELCC) systems.	x	×	
Adopt the OECD benchmark of allocating at least 1% of Canada's GDP to ELCC.	x		
Use the federal Child Care Secretariat to track financial and policy allocations across the country and coordinate intergovernmental action, monitoring and evaluation.	x	x	x
Improve data collection from an intersectional perspective to understand the needs of families and workers within the child care and child and youth sector, including collecting disaggregated data. ²⁰	X	x	X
Wages and Time Off			
Create a comprehensive workforce strategy that will address and support fair wages/benefits by designing and implementing provincial/territorial wage grids	x	x	x
Therefore we recommend designing and implementing an all encompassing and operational supply-side funding model that will:			
Increase ECE salaries and ensure they are fair wages		x	x
Ensure that out of school/school age care workers are not being left behind.		x	x

Priority areas for policy change and investment	FEDERAL Government	PROVINCIAL AND Territorial Governments	MUNICIPAL Governments
Mental Health Supports			
Access to flexible funding to support the mental health of the child care workforce including through the Community Services Recovery Fund and as an element of workforce strategies.	x	x	x
Invest in greater mental health supports for children and youth, caregivers, including parents, grandparents, guardians, etc.	x	x	x
Integrate counseling and psychotherapy into provincial and territorial health insurance plans.		x	
Increase funding for community-based mental health services and supports delivered to frontline child and youth workers, including health promotion and mental illness prevention programs and strategies, peer support, self-guided mental health skills building, mental health first aid, social and emotional learning, etc.	x	x	x
Professional Development Opportunities			
Increase access to funding, including through the Community Service Recovery Fund, to train frontline ECEs and child and youth workers to support children and youth dealing with the mental health impacts of the pandemic, chronic stress, challenging events, trauma and crisis.	x	x	x
Design and implement professional development opportunities that provide a clear path for frontline workers that leads to career advancement and leadership roles.	x	x	x

Priority areas for policy change and investment	FEDERAL Government	PROVINCIAL AND TERRITORIAL GOVERNMENTS	MUNICIPAL Governments
Education, Recruitment, and Retention			
As an element of workforce strategies, establish programs to incentivize careers as ECEs including significant tuition subsidies and wage replacements. These programs need to be high-quality, affordable, expedited, and offer paid experiential learning opportunities.	x	×	
To address retention, provide additional funding to reduce reliance on short-term contracts, increase wages, and increase the number of full-time positions with benefits.	х	x	х
Invest in public awareness campaigns aimed at addressing stigma and misconceptions associated with Early Childhood Education and Child and Youth Workers and encourage more people to join the sector.	x	x	
Ensure this public recognition is paired with ongoing and substantial policy change that will better support ECEs and Child and Youth Workers including by implementing other recommendations outlined.	X	X	
Support for Anti-Racism, Anti-Oppression Strategies and Policies			
Increase funding for anti-racism and anti-oppression training including through the Community Services Recovery Fund.	x		
Include training on anti-racism and anti-oppression within post-secondary ECE and Child and Youth Worker program curriculum.		x	

Recommendations for Employers

Employers in the sector also have a responsibility to support the mental health of their workers. This section aims to identify areas for employers to address the challenges outlined above.

Invest in Staff

In human service organizations, staff are our most important asset. To ensure programs are running smoothly and effectively, staff need supports to do their best work. An organization can meaningfully support staff by providing:

- Wage tops ups and committing to inflationary increases every year.
- Benefits including access to counseling and psychotherapy.
- Paid time-off for vacation and sick leave.
- Retirement savings through a pension or RRSP matching program (some provinces have plans for the non-profit sector).
- Professional development opportunities including a clear path to career advancement.

Commit to Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion (EDI)

Families accessing child care and youth programs are diverse. In addition, frontline staff are disproportionately women and disproportionately racialized. Organizations need to ensure that they can adequately support the children, youth, and families they serve while also meeting the needs of their diverse staff. Organizations are recommended to invest in EDI including:

- Conduct an audit to see where the organization and employees are at.
- Invest in training for staff on how to support BIPOC families.
- Invest in training for management on how to better support racialized staff.
- Build and implement a process that leads to changes for racialized workers including opportunities for advancement within the organization.

Peer to Peer Mentoring

Often due to a lack of resources, new ECEs and Child and Youth Workers immediately begin managing groups on their own without much support. This can lead to staff feeling overwhelmed and eventually leaving the sector. By providing Peer to Peer mentorship opportunities, an organization can provide support for new staff while also providing leadership opportunities to existing staff. This not only strengthens morale, but it also increases the quality of programs.

Conclusion

The pandemic has been challenging for all frontline workers including ECEs and Child and Youth Workers. The past two years have exacerbated existing challenges within the sector. This sector is vital to the growth and development of our economy, allowing people, particularly women, to get back into the workforce. More needs to be done to support the essential workers so many families and communities rely on.

This brief surfaced some emerging challenges and provided recommendations to all levels of government. More research needs to be done on how to support the sector, including how to reduce burnout. In addition, research into support for Indigenous child care workers, and ECEs and Child and Youth Workers in the North or rural and remote communities needs to be explored within this context.

We need to be innovative in how we address these challenges and ensure that we take a collaborative and intersectional approach to the work. ECEs and Child and Youth Workers are essential, and by implementing the above recommendations we can ensure they are better supported and contribute to higher quality programming for families across Canada.







